

Message

From: Detlef Knappe [knappe@ncsu.edu]
Sent: 11/2/2016 9:25:43 PM
To: Sun, Mei [msun8@uncc.edu]; Lindstrom, Andrew [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=04bf7cf26aa44ce29763fbc1c1b2338e-Lindstrom, Andrew]; Strynar, Mark [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5a9910d5b38e471497bd875fd329a20a-Strynar, Mark]
Subject: Re: Revision Requested for Manuscript ID ez-2016-00398y

Some thoughts about comment 3 of reviewer 4 would be helpful, too. A simple response would be that we do not have sufficient data to compare PFOA mass flows from PFOA production days to Gen X during the monitoring period of the paper. But could be interesting to make such a comparison if there is data.

Detlef

On 11/2/16 5:03 PM, Sun, Mei wrote:

Hi Mark and Andy

Sorry I had to leave in a hurry for class. Here is a list of things your input would be very helpful, based on our discussion:

Reviewer 2, comment 8 & 10

Reviewer 4, comment 2 & 5.

Is there anything else we talked about but I missed?

Thank you.

Mei Sun

Assistant Professor
Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering
University of North Carolina at Charlotte
Energy Production and Infrastructure Center 3163
9201 University City Blvd | Charlotte, NC 28223
Phone: 704-687-1723 | Fax: 704-687-0957
Website: <https://coefs.uncc.edu/msun8/>

On Wed, Nov 2, 2016 at 2:15 PM, Lindstrom, Andrew <Lindstrom.Andrew@epa.gov> wrote:

From: Sun, Mei [mailto:msun8@uncc.edu]
Sent: Friday, October 21, 2016 6:20 PM
To: Detlef Knappe <knappe@ncsu.edu>; Strynar, Mark <Strynar.Mark@epa.gov>; Lindstrom, Andrew <Lindstrom.Andrew@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: Revision Requested for Manuscript ID ez-2016-00398y

Our paper is accepted with revision!

Mei Sun

Assistant Professor

Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering

University of North Carolina at Charlotte

Energy Production and Infrastructure Center 3163

9201 University City Blvd | Charlotte, NC 28223

Phone: 704-687-1723 | Fax: 704-687-0957

Website: <https://coefs.uncc.edu/msun8/>

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Environmental Science & Technology Letters** <onbehalfof+arnold-office+estlett.acs.org@manuscriptcentral.com>

Date: Fri, Oct 21, 2016 at 4:29 PM

Subject: Revision Requested for Manuscript ID ez-2016-00398y

To: msun8@uncc.edu

21-Oct-2016

Journal: Environmental Science & Technology Letters

Manuscript ID: ez-2016-00398y

Title: "Legacy and emerging perfluoroalkyl substances are important drinking water contaminants in the Cape Fear River Watershed of North Carolina"

Author(s): Sun, Mei; Arevalo, Elisa; Strynar, Mark; Lindstrom, Andrew; Richardson, Michael; Kearns, Ben; Smith, Chris ; Pickett, Adam ; Knappe, Detlef

Dear Dr. Sun:

We have received the reviews of your manuscript and they are enclosed with this letter. As you will see from the attached reviews, the reviewer(s) have identified important issues that must be

addressed in order to consider your manuscript further for publication.

Based on the reviews and my own reading of your manuscript, I have concluded that your manuscript may eventually be publishable in Environmental Science & Technology Letters, but only with appropriate revision that adequately addresses the concerns of the reviewers. A review of the revised manuscript may be required by one or more reviewers.

The principal concerns expressed are regarding analytical details/protocols and the general flow of the manuscript (i.e., how the different facets are combined).

If you choose to resubmit, we would like to receive your revision as soon as possible, and no later than 04-Nov-2016. Late revisions will automatically be rejected.

A point-by-point response to the comments by the Editor and the reviewers MUST be included and uploaded as "Other Files for Editors Only" detailing the reviewer comments and your direct response or change made. This response must contain an exact reproduction of the comments of the Associate Editor and of each reviewer (by reviewer), with your response indicated below each comment. Your revised manuscript will not be reviewed without submittal of this response. Please strictly adhere to the following format:

Comment (12 point italicized font)

Reply (indented, 12 point normal font)

“Revised text as it appears in the text (in quotes, 10 point blue font)”

Your replies should make it clear how the manuscript was changed, or provide convincing reasons for declining to make a recommended change. You should endeavor to make revisions to the manuscript so as to avoid similar concerns or comments by other readers. Responses to comments should not be merely rebuttals or attempts to educate the reviewer, as these comments would not be seen by a reader if the material is published. I also would like to caution you that Environmental Science & Technology Letters editorial policy directs that if a manuscript is not very close to acceptability after the first revision it should be declined. Therefore, making these changes at this stage is absolutely essential.

To revise your manuscript, log into ACS Paragon Plus at <https://acs.manuscriptcentral.com/acs> and select "My Authoring Activity." There you will find your manuscript title listed under "Revisions Requested by Editorial Office." With the exception of your main text file, all of your original files will be available to you for review or replacement during the revision process. If you need to replace a file, please be sure to remove the original before uploading a new one. In all circumstances you must upload a new manuscript text file.

The re-submitted manuscript should be a clean copy with all changes but not marked (i.e. no highlighted text or text in different colors).

Supporting information should contain a version of the manuscript highlighted in blue or red font for easy identification of the changed text. Do NOT use “track changes” to show this as the manuscript changes can become difficult to follow. Mark this material as “review only”.

Length: A Letter in Environmental Science & Technology Letters is limited to 3000 words (not including references or figure captions), with 200 words allocated per figure (please review examples on the journal website, <http://pubs.acs.org/journal/estlcv> and Instructions for Authors, <http://pubs.acs.org/page/estlcv/submission/authors.html> for details). To meet these length requirements, consider placing large display items and experimental details in the Supporting Information (SI) section. However, if too much information needs to be placed in the SI the

study may be considered to be inappropriate for this Letters-type publication, and it therefore may be rejected for this reason. Adhering to the guidelines will assist in our efforts to publish your urgent research in record time.

Format: Your revised manuscript must adhere to ACS format, especially references. Environmental Science & Technology Letters's guidelines are available at <http://pubs.acs.org/page/estlcu/submission/authors.html>. Note that in ACS Paragon Plus, authors have the option of embedding graphics into the manuscript or supplying graphics separately.

Table of Contents Graphic: Environmental Science & Technology Letters requires a Table of Contents Graphic. The graphic requested for the table of contents entry could be in the form of a structure, graph, drawing, SEM/TEM micrograph, or reaction scheme. The author must submit a graphic in the actual size to be used for the Table of Contents, to be 4 cm high and 8 cm wide. Type size of labels, formulas, or numbers within the graphic must be legible. Tables or spectra are not acceptable. Please label this page "For Table of Contents Use Only" and include the manuscript title and authors.

Supporting Information: If the manuscript is accompanied by any supporting information for publication, a brief description of the supplementary material is required in the manuscript. The appropriate format is: Supporting Information. Brief statement in nonsentence format listing the contents of the material supplied as Supporting Information.

Funding Sources: Authors are required to report ALL funding sources and grant/award numbers. Enter all sources of funding for ALL authors in BOTH the Open Funder Registry tool in ACS Paragon Plus and in the manuscript to meet this requirement. See http://pubs.acs.org/page/4authors/funder_options.html for complete instructions.

Contact Information: On the manuscript please mark the corresponding author with an asterisk (*). This is the author who should receive communications from readers. On the manuscript provide current contact information for this author: address; phone and fax numbers; email address

Please review the journal guidelines regarding structure and data deposition in the Information for Authors.

ACS Publications uses CrossCheck's iThenticate software to detect instances of similarity in submitted manuscripts. In publishing only original research, ACS is committed to deterring plagiarism, including self-plagiarism. Your manuscript may be screened for similarity to published material.

We look forward to considering your revised paper. Please contact our office if you have any questions or concerns as you proceed. Your interest in publishing your work in Environmental Science & Technology Letters is appreciated.

Sincerely,

PBI / Ex. 4

PLEASE MAKE THE FOLLOWING CORRECTIONS:

PBI / Ex. 4

PBI / Ex. 4

PBI / Ex. 4

PBI / Ex. 4

PBI / Ex. 4

FOR ASSISTANCE WITH YOUR MANUSCRIPT SUBMISSION PLEASE CONTACT:

ACS Publications Customer Services & Information (CSI)

Email: support@services.acs.org

Phone: [202-872-4357](tel:202-872-4357)

Toll Free Phone: [800-227-9919](tel:800-227-9919) (USA/Canada only)

PLEASE NOTE: This email message, including any attachments, contains confidential information related to peer review and is intended solely for the personal use of the recipient(s) named above. No part of this communication or any related attachments may be shared with or disclosed to any third party or organization without the explicit prior written consent of the journal Editor and ACS. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient or is not responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you have received this communication in error. Please notify the sender immediately by e-mail, and delete the original message. Thank you.

--

Detlef Knappe
Professor
319-E Mann Hall
Department of Civil, Construction, and Environmental Engineering
North Carolina State University
Campus Box 7908
Raleigh, NC 27695-7908

Phone: 919-515-8791
Fax: 919-515-7908
E-mail: knappe@ncsu.edu
Web page: <http://knappelab.wordpress.ncsu.edu/>